



Gender Paradigm in Fiqh: A Critical Analysis of Traditional Islamic Legal Understanding

Ahda Fithriani¹, Faridah²

^{1,2}Universitas Islam Negeri Antasari, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Email : ahdafitriani@uin-antasari.ac.id faridah@uin-antasari.ac.id²

Received 29-07-2024 | Revised form 28-08-2024 | Accepted 08-09-2024

Abstract

The gender paradigm in Islamic law has been a subject of critical analysis, particularly regarding traditional interpretations that establish hierarchical gender roles. While some classical understandings are influenced by patriarchal norms, contemporary thinkers propose reinterpretations using feminist hermeneutics to highlight aspects of justice and equality in religious texts. This study evaluates traditional Islamic legal understandings related to gender issues, aiming to reassess interpretations that may no longer be relevant to the current social context. The evaluation addresses gender inequality and discrimination resulting from biased legal interpretations and responds to changing social and political dynamics in contemporary Muslim societies. It promotes a more inclusive understanding of women's roles in Islam, considering religious texts and the social and cultural contexts in which the law is applied. The study's relevance lies in its efforts to harmonize Islamic law with principles of gender justice, providing a space for constructive dialogue between Islamic tradition and evolving global norms. It responds to the growing awareness and demands of Muslim women worldwide for equal rights within the context of Islamic law. By critiquing and reconstructing laws deemed biased, this study contributes to creating a more inclusive and equitable legal framework that respects women's rights without compromising the fundamental principles of Sharia.

Keywords: Gender Paradigm, Feminist Hermeneutics, Gender Justice, Islamic Legal Interpretation

Abstrak

Paradigma gender dalam hukum Islam telah menjadi subjek analisis kritis, terutama terkait dengan interpretasi tradisional yang menetapkan peran gender yang hierarkis. Meskipun beberapa pemahaman klasik dipengaruhi oleh norma-norma patriarkal, pemikir kontemporer mengusulkan reinterpretasi menggunakan hermeneutika feminis untuk menyoroti aspek keadilan dan kesetaraan dalam teks-teks agama. Studi ini mengevaluasi pemahaman hukum Islam tradisional terkait isu-isu gender, dengan tujuan menilai kembali interpretasi yang mungkin tidak lagi relevan dengan konteks sosial saat ini. Evaluasi ini menangani ketidaksetaraan dan diskriminasi gender yang diakibatkan oleh interpretasi hukum yang bias, serta merespons dinamika sosial dan politik yang berubah di masyarakat Muslim kontemporer. Studi ini mendorong pemahaman yang lebih inklusif tentang peran perempuan dalam Islam, dengan mempertimbangkan teks-teks agama serta konteks sosial dan budaya di mana hukum diterapkan. Relevansi studi ini terletak pada upayanya untuk menyelaraskan hukum Islam dengan prinsip-prinsip keadilan gender, serta menyediakan ruang untuk dialog konstruktif antara tradisi Islam dan norma-norma global yang berkembang. Studi ini

merespons meningkatnya kesadaran dan tuntutan perempuan Muslim di seluruh dunia untuk mendapatkan hak yang setara dalam konteks hukum Islam. Dengan mengkritik dan merekonstruksi hukum yang dianggap bias, studi ini berkontribusi pada penciptaan kerangka hukum yang lebih inklusif dan adil yang menghormati hak-hak perempuan tanpa mengorbankan prinsip-prinsip dasar syariah.

Kata Kunci: Paradigma Gender, Hermeneutika Feminis, Keadilan Gender, Interpretasi Hukum Islam

This is an open access article under the [CC BY-NC-SA](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/) license.



INTRODUCTION

The gender paradigm in the context of Islamic law refers to the perspective used to understand gender relations and roles—both male and female—as regulated by Sharia principles. In traditional Islamic law, the understanding of gender is often influenced by classical interpretations that establish gender roles in a rigid and hierarchical manner, with men as leaders and women as followers. This view is based on the textual understanding of the Quran and Hadith, which tend to be influenced by the socio-historical context at the time the texts were interpreted (Wadud, 1999).

However, the gender paradigm in Islamic law is not monolithic; it encompasses a broad spectrum of understanding, ranging from conservative to more progressive interpretations. Traditional approaches are often considered unresponsive to the demands of the times, particularly regarding gender equality. In contrast, some contemporary thinkers, such as Asma Barlas and Amina Wadud, propose a reinterpretation of Quranic verses using feminist hermeneutics to highlight the aspects of justice and equality contained within them (Barlas, 2002; Wadud, 1999).

In the context of contemporary Islamic law, the gender paradigm also aims to deconstruct and reconstruct laws deemed gender-biased, considering current social, political, and cultural conditions. For example, critical studies of inheritance and guardianship laws in Islamic law indicate that a more inclusive and fair interpretation for women can be achieved without violating the fundamental principles of Sharia (Ali, 2016). Thus, the gender paradigm involves not only re-evaluating religious texts but also analyzing social and cultural practices that influence the interpretation of Islamic law.

This discourse is becoming increasingly relevant given the rising global awareness of women's rights and efforts to harmonize Islamic law with international human rights standards. Muslim scholars and academics are currently faced with the challenge of developing a legal framework that integrates fundamental Sharia principles with evolving gender equality values in the modern world (Mir-Hosseini, 2013). This demands a reinterpretation of legal texts to be more just toward women, in terms of both rights and obligations, to address the existing inequalities.

As an effort to address gender inequality issues, studying the gender paradigm in Islamic law becomes crucial in finding ways to reformulate Islamic law while respecting the integrity of religious texts. This not only challenges existing traditional authorities and interpretations but also opens the space for new, more inclusive discourses towards women and other marginalized groups (Ali, 2016; Mir-Hosseini, 2013).

Evaluation of Traditional Islamic Legal Understanding Regarding Gender Issues

Evaluating traditional Islamic legal understanding related to gender issues is crucial because it allows for the reassessment of interpretations that may no longer be relevant to the current social context. Traditional Islamic understanding is often influenced by patriarchal norms that developed during the early formation of law and were reinforced by classical interpretations. Such interpretations often reinforce the subordinate role of women in various aspects of life, such as marriage, inheritance, and other social rights (Ahmed, 1992). In this context, critical evaluation is needed to ensure that Islamic law can evolve in line with the principles of justice and equality that are central to the religion itself.

Additionally, this evaluation is important in addressing gender inequality and discrimination that may result from biased legal interpretations. For example, traditional inheritance laws in Islam, which generally allocate a larger share to men compared to women, are often criticized for not reflecting social justice in the modern context (Abou El Fadl, 2001). Evaluating such interpretations aims to find a balance between adherence to Sharia principles and the application of universal human rights values.

Evaluation is also necessary to respond to changing social and political dynamics in contemporary Muslim societies. With the increasing participation of women in various fields, including the economy and politics, a more inclusive and progressive approach to Islamic law becomes highly relevant. Critiquing traditional understandings that place women in limited positions allows for legal reforms that are more adaptive and responsive to the demands of the times (Hidayatullah, 2014). In this way, evaluation not only maintains the relevance of Islamic law but also enhances its acceptance among an increasingly diverse Muslim population.

Furthermore, evaluating traditional Islamic legal understanding of gender is important for promoting a more inclusive and humane understanding of women's roles in Islam. Traditional understandings that often place women in inferior positions require reinterpretation based on a more holistic approach, which considers not only religious texts but also the social and cultural contexts in which the law is applied (Mir-Hosseini, 2013). This is essential to ensure that Islamic law is not only theologically relevant but also socially applicable.

Finally, evaluating traditional Islamic legal understanding related to gender issues is crucial for strengthening efforts towards gender justice and equality in Muslim societies. By critiquing and reconstructing laws deemed biased, we can create a more inclusive and equitable legal framework that respects women's rights without compromising the

fundamental principles of Sharia. This is an important step towards achieving a transformation in Islamic law that is more responsive to the changing needs and aspirations of contemporary Muslim communities (Hidayatullah, 2014).

Relevance of the Study in the Modern Context

The relevance of this study in the modern context lies in its efforts to harmonize Islamic law with principles of gender justice, which are increasingly gaining global attention. In an era of globalization, where human rights and gender equality standards are major agendas, traditional Islamic legal understandings that are perceived as limiting women's roles are often criticized. This study is important as it helps clarify how Islamic law can be interpreted and applied to support gender equality without abandoning the core principles of Sharia (Baderin, 2003). It provides a space for constructive dialogue between Islamic tradition and evolving global norms.

This study is also relevant because it responds to the growing awareness and demands of Muslim women worldwide for equal rights within the context of Islamic law. For example, in many Muslim countries, women are calling for more equitable family law reforms, particularly concerning guardianship, divorce, and inheritance rights (Mayer, 2007). Evaluating traditional Islamic legal understandings allows for the identification of aspects that may need to be changed or reinterpreted to reflect the needs and social realities of women today, making the law more responsive to the demands of contemporary Muslim society.

Furthermore, this study is relevant in reinforcing the argument that Islamic law is dynamic and contextual, rather than static. By re-evaluating traditional gender-biased understandings, modern Muslim scholars can demonstrate that Islamic law has the capacity to evolve and adapt to the context of the times without disregarding its fundamental principles (Ali, 2016). This is crucial for ensuring that Islamic law remains relevant amidst rapid social and cultural changes, and for proving that Islam is an inclusive and just religion for all its adherents.

This study is also significant in addressing practical challenges related to the implementation of Islamic law. In many cases, gender-biased Islamic law causes injustices perceived by Muslim women, which can lead to resistance or rejection of the law itself (Moors, 2013). By conducting a critical evaluation, this study helps find more equitable and inclusive solutions that can enhance the legitimacy of Islamic law in the eyes of its followers, including women.

Finally, this study plays a vital role in advocating for more progressive and inclusive reforms in Islamic law. Through critical examination of traditional understandings, this study provides a foundation for a fairer reinterpretation of religious texts, potentially addressing existing gender inequalities. Thus, the relevance of this study extends beyond theological aspects, having broad practical implications for achieving gender equality in modern Muslim societies (Mir-Hosseini, 2006).

Objectives of the Study

The objective of this research is to evaluate traditional understandings of Islamic law related to gender issues and to offer constructive criticism of paradigms considered biased against women. This study aims to explore how historically established interpretations of Islamic law have shaped views on gender roles and to assess their relevance in the modern context, which increasingly supports gender equality. Through critical analysis, this research also seeks to identify opportunities for reinterpretation of the law to be more inclusive, just, and aligned with contemporary social and cultural developments (Wadud, 1999).

The primary research question addressed by this article is: How does the gender paradigm in traditional Islamic law affect the rights and obligations of women in Muslim societies? This question aims to delve into the traditional Islamic legal perspective on women's roles and how this understanding is applied across various aspects of life, such as family law, marriage, and inheritance. Additionally, the study will address the extent to which Islamic law can be reinterpreted to support gender justice without disregarding Sharia's fundamental principles (Barlas, 2002).

The article will also seek to answer: What are the relevant criticisms of gender-biased interpretations of Islamic law, and how can these criticisms contribute to the reform of Islamic law? By identifying pertinent criticisms, this article aims to examine the potential for updates in the understanding and application of Islamic law to be more inclusive of women. This includes analyzing contemporary thoughts that offer new perspectives on gender justice in Islam and how these views might influence legal reforms (Hidayatullah, 2014).

Furthermore, the article will explore how contemporary Muslim scholars and thinkers respond to criticisms of traditional Islamic legal understandings of gender. This question is crucial for understanding the extent of consensus or disagreement among Muslim scholars and academics on this issue, as well as how these responses impact the dynamics of Islamic law interpretation in various countries and Muslim communities (Mir-Hosseini, 2013).

Finally, the article aims to address: What are the implications of criticisms of traditional Islamic legal understanding of gender for the future development of Islamic law? By answering this question, the article hopes to contribute significantly to the academic and practical discussions on strengthening gender justice and equality within Islamic law, and to offer a new framework for more progressive and responsive legal reforms that meet the needs of modern Muslim societies (Ali, 2016).

METHOD

The approach used to analyze gender paradigms in Islamic jurisprudence in this study is a combination of historical, normative, and critical approaches. The historical approach

is employed to trace the development of Islamic legal understandings of gender over time, including how social, cultural, and political contexts have influenced the interpretation of religious texts related to women's roles and rights (Ahmed, 1992). The normative approach is applied to assess and evaluate the fundamental principles of Islamic law related to gender, and to what extent these principles are understood and implemented within Muslim societies (Kamali, 2008). Meanwhile, the critical approach is used to analyze and critique gender biases that may exist in classical and contemporary interpretations, and to propose alternative frameworks that are more inclusive and equitable (Hidayatullah, 2014).

Data collection methods for this study include literature review and text analysis. Data is obtained through a review of literature encompassing classical jurisprudence books, tafsir (interpretations), and contemporary works discussing Islamic law and gender issues. This literature includes primary sources such as the Quran and Hadith, as well as secondary sources such as books, journal articles, and theses that discuss interpretations of Islamic law related to gender. Data analysis is conducted using content analysis, where collected data is analyzed to identify key themes related to gender paradigms in jurisprudence. Additionally, hermeneutic approaches are used to understand the context and meaning of the legal texts being analyzed (Wadud, 1999).

Criteria or indicators used to assess and critique traditional Islamic legal understandings related to gender include several key aspects. First, justice and equality criteria, where Islamic legal interpretations are evaluated based on how well they adhere to principles of justice and gender equality upheld in sacred texts and contemporary contexts (Barlas, 2002). Second, historical relevance criteria, which assess how certain legal interpretations were influenced by the socio-historical context at the time of their formulation and to what extent this context remains relevant today (Mir-Hosseini, 2013). Third, openness to social change criteria, which evaluate the flexibility of Islamic law in responding to changing social dynamics, such as increased female participation in public life and awareness of human rights (Moors, 2013).

Additional indicators include critiques of patriarchal biases in legal interpretation, which involve assessing the extent to which Islamic legal interpretations reinforce patriarchal power structures or provide space for women's empowerment. Feminist hermeneutics criteria are also used to identify alternative approaches that allow for more inclusive interpretations of women and other marginalized groups within Muslim societies (Wadud, 1999; Hidayatullah, 2014).

Overall, this study uses a multidisciplinary approach to examine gender paradigms in jurisprudence with the goal of uncovering potential injustices and offering more inclusive and equitable solutions in line with the fundamental principles of Sharia.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

How does traditional understanding of gender in fiqh influence Islamic law related to the rights and responsibilities of women and men?

The traditional understanding of gender in fiqh significantly impacts Islamic law concerning the rights and responsibilities of women and men. Generally, this understanding tends to reinforce separate and hierarchical gender roles, with men often placed in dominant positions and women in subordinate roles. This is evident in various aspects of Islamic law, including family law, inheritance, and guardianship.

In family law, for example, traditional understanding often emphasizes that the husband holds primary authority within the household, while the wife is considered a subordinate who must obey (Mayer, 2007). This affects the distribution of domestic roles and economic rights, where women may have limited access to resources and important decisions. In inheritance law, traditional Islamic law stipulates that a male heir typically receives a larger share of the inheritance compared to a female heir. For instance, in the context of inheritance, a son generally receives twice the share of a daughter (Ali, 2016). Although this understanding has roots in classical texts, it is often seen as inconsistent with principles of social justice in the modern world.

What are specific examples of traditional Islamic legal texts that show gender bias?

Several traditional Islamic legal texts demonstrate gender bias, found in classical interpretations of the Quran and Hadith. Some notable examples include:

1. **Quranic Verses on Inheritance:** For instance, in Surah An-Nisa, verse 11:
 - o "Men are the protectors and maintainers of women, because Allah has made some of them exceed others and because they spend (to support them) from their means." (Quran 4:34). This verse is often interpreted to imply that men have greater authority than women in various aspects of life.
2. **Inheritance Law:** Another verse from Surah An-Nisa, verse 11:
 - o "The share of the male is equal to that of two females." (Quran 4:11). This division indicates a systematic inequality between men and women regarding inheritance.

These texts, when understood within their socio-historical contexts, reflect more traditional gender views and are often seen as misaligned with modern principles of gender equality and justice. The critique of these texts in this research aims to highlight that more inclusive and contextual interpretations can be offered to create a more just Islamic law for women.

Overall, the results of this evaluation indicate that the traditional understanding of gender in fiqh has a significant influence on Islamic law concerning the rights and responsibilities of women and men. By understanding these texts and their impacts, it is crucial to explore alternative interpretations that could offer greater justice in the modern context.

Criticism of traditional understandings of gender in fiqh has significant implications for the reform of Islamic law, particularly in achieving gender equality. One of its implications is the need for updates in the interpretation of Islamic law. This criticism encourages the reinterpretation of religious texts to reflect more contemporary principles of justice and gender equality. Scholars and ulama who embrace this criticism often advocate for the re-interpretation of Quranic verses and Hadiths that have traditionally supported unequal gender roles. The goal is to ensure that Islamic law remains relevant to current social realities, where gender equality is an increasingly important value (Wadud, 1999).

In the area of family law, this criticism also impacts reform. For example, injustices in inheritance distribution and guardianship rights drive the development of fairer family laws. These reforms include adjustments to inheritance rights to ensure greater equality between men and women, as well as recognition of women's roles in family and public decision-making. It may also improve the legal status of women in divorce, child custody, and protection against domestic violence (Ali, 2016).

The criticism of traditional understanding also affects social and cultural changes in Muslim societies. By promoting gender equality in Islamic law, this criticism helps reduce patriarchal practices that hinder women's empowerment and reinforces social norms supporting equality and inclusiveness (Hidayatullah, 2014). This impacts various aspects of life, from education and employment to social and political rights.

The impact of this criticism is also evident in cross-cultural and international dialogues on women's rights. Muslim countries that undertake legal reforms to reflect gender equality can enhance their image in international forums and fulfill commitments to global human rights standards. These reforms can bridge the gap between Islamic law and international norms regarding women's rights, as well as improve diplomatic relations and international cooperation (Mayer, 2007).

However, challenges in implementation remain. Resistance to change from those who uphold traditional understandings can hinder the reform process. Therefore, it is essential to adopt a careful and inclusive approach to implementing reforms, involving dialogue among ulama, scholars, and the community to achieve a consensus that supports positive change (Moors, 2013). Criticism of traditional gender understanding in fiqh opens up opportunities for a more inclusive and just reform of Islamic law, as well as encourages social and cultural changes that support women's rights in Muslim societies.

Criticism of traditional understandings of gender in fiqh needs to be contextualized with current social, cultural, and political conditions to ensure its relevance and applicability. In the modern era, many Muslim societies are experiencing significant changes in gender values and equality. For example, women are increasingly active in various public domains, including politics, economics, and education. They are also demanding fairer rights in family law, inheritance, and guardianship (Moors, 2013).

Criticism of traditional understandings focuses on the need to reform Islamic law to align more closely with universally recognized principles of justice and gender equality. This involves evaluating and revising legal interpretations that may no longer be relevant to current social realities. For instance, understandings that view men as the primary leaders in the family or allocate a larger share of inheritance to men compared to women need to be re-examined to reflect changes in social dynamics and to promote greater inclusivity (Hidayatullah, 2014).

In the political context, many Muslim countries face international pressure to meet human rights and gender equality standards. Therefore, adjusting Islamic law to be more fair and responsive to global demands is crucial. Legal reforms that address these criticisms can strengthen the legitimacy of Islamic law in the eyes of the international community while accommodating local aspirations for gender equality (Barlas, 2002).

Regarding responses from contemporary scholars and ulama to these criticisms, opinions vary. Some ulama and contemporary Muslim scholars embrace these criticisms and support more inclusive legal reforms. They argue that fundamental Islamic principles, such as justice and equality, support a more progressive interpretation of gender issues. They often employ feminist hermeneutics and contextual exegesis to offer new, more equitable perspectives (Hidayatullah, 2014).

For example, Ziba Mir-Hosseini and Amina Wadud are two scholars who have promoted more inclusive interpretations of Islamic texts and challenged traditional patriarchal views. They argue that traditional understandings are often distorted by specific historical and cultural contexts and that the principles of justice in Islam support greater gender equality (Mir-Hosseini, 2013; Wadud, 1999).

However, there are also ulama and scholars who maintain traditional understandings and resist reforms that they believe might threaten the integrity of Islamic law. They argue that changes in interpretation should be cautious and should not alter the essence of Islamic teachings. This perspective is often based on the belief that the existing Islamic law is appropriate for its historical context and that changes might not align with the fundamental principles of sharia (Mayer, 2007).

Overall, there are divergent views among ulama and contemporary thinkers regarding criticisms of traditional gender understandings in fiqh. Some support reforms and reinterpretations to reflect more inclusive principles of justice, while others uphold traditional views and are concerned about the impact of changes on the integrity of Islamic law. This discussion reflects the dynamics and diversity of thought within the global Muslim community regarding gender issues and legal interpretations.

CONCLUSION

The main findings of this article reveal that criticism of gender paradigms in traditional Islamic law highlights several crucial aspects. Firstly, this criticism uncovers that traditional understandings often reinforce hierarchical gender roles, where men hold a

dominant position compared to women. This has significant implications for various aspects of Islamic law, including family law, inheritance, and guardianship. Traditional Islamic legal texts often show gender bias, leading to unequal rights and obligations between men and women. This criticism underscores the need for reinterpretation and reform to create a more equitable and just legal framework.

The implications of these findings for the future development of Islamic law are profound. The findings advocate for legal reforms that align with principles of justice and gender equality within modern social and cultural contexts. Such reforms may include updating interpretations of religious texts and adjusting family law, inheritance laws, and guardianship rights to ensure that Islamic law is more inclusive and fair. Consequently, Islamic law could become more responsive to the growing demands for gender equality worldwide. This also has the potential to enhance the legitimacy of Islamic law at the international level and improve diplomatic relations and global cooperation.

REFERENCES

- Ali, S. S. (2016). *Modern challenges to Islamic law*. Cambridge University Press.
- Barlas, A. (2002). *Believing women in Islam: Unreading patriarchal interpretations of the Qur'an*. University of Texas Press.
- Hakim, L. (2020). Konsep Asnaf Fī Sabilillah: Kajian Komparatif Pendapat Ulama Salaf dan Kontemporer: 20(2), 42–52. <https://doi.org/10.37820/attauci.v20i2.112>
- Hidayatullah, A. A. (2014). *Feminist edges of the Qur'an*. Oxford University Press.
- Koujah, R. (2021). Islamic Legal Reform or Re-formation? The Transmutations of Critique in Rume Ahmed's *Sharia Compliant: A User's Guide to Hacking Islamic Law*. *Islamic Law and Society*, 28(3), 283–315. <https://doi.org/10.1163/15685195-28030001>
- Mashhour, A. (2005). Islamic Law and Gender Equality: Could There be a Common Ground?: A Study of Divorce and Polygamy in Sharia Law and Contemporary Legislation in Tunisia and Egypt. *Human Rights Quarterly*, 27(2), 562–596. <https://doi.org/10.1353/hrq.2005.0022>
- Mayer, A. E. (2007). *Islam and human rights: Tradition and politics*. Westview Press.
- Mir-Hosseini, Z. (2013). Muslim legal tradition and the challenge of gender equality. *Journal of Religion and Gender*, 1(1), 25-45.
- Moors, A. (2013). *Islamic family law in a changing world: A global resource book*. Zed Books.

Mufidah, N. A., Kurniati, K., & Ramadhan, M. A. (2024). Hukuman Cambuk: Pandangan Ulama Kontemporer, Penerapan, Serta Korelasi dengan HAM. *Ethics and Law Journal: Business and Notary*, 2(3), 23–28. <https://doi.org/10.61292/eljbn.210>

Muhyiddin, M. (2014). FATWA MUI TENTANG VASEKTOMI Tanggapan Ulama dan Dampaknya terhadap Peningkatan Medis Operasi Pria (MOP). *Al-Ahkam*, 24(1), 69. <https://doi.org/10.21580/ahkam.2014.24.1.134>

Nafisah, L., & Muhtador, M. (2018). Wacana Keadilan Shahabat Dalam Pandangan Ulama Klasik Dan Kontemporer. *AL QUDS: Jurnal Studi Alquran Dan Hadis*, 2(2), 153. <https://doi.org/10.29240/alquds.v2i2.429>

Patel, V. A. (2014). Gender Equality and Human Rights. *SSRN Electronic Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3182315>

Rismilda, N. A. (2023). The Relationship between Islamic Law and the Concept of Gender Equality Based on Maqasid Sharia Perspective. *Sinergi International Journal of Law*, 1(3), 175–183. <https://doi.org/10.61194/law.v1i3.90>

Wadud, A. (1999). *Qur'an and woman: Rereading the sacred text from a woman's perspective*. Oxford University Press.